

**Project:** The Impact of Ultra-Low-Cost-Carrier Competition on Airfare

**Course:** Senior Capstone

**Keywords:** Econometrics, airline competition, fixed-effect regression models

**Project Summary:**

This project was discovered after my internship experience at Southwest Airlines as a Market Strategy Analyst in December 2016. During my internship, I was responsible for creating a yield management strategy for 7 airline markets in the United States. At Southwest I noticed that Ultra-Low-Cost-Carriers, such as Frontier, Spirit, and Allegiant, were credited for dramatically decreasing fares in airline markets. As a capstone intern project, I used an econometric model, produced by Michael D. Wittman and William S. Swelbar at the MIT International Center for Air Transportation, to identify what the fare decreases Southwest could expect when ULCC entered their markets.

My research expands on previous literature and econometric models to incorporate the effect of ULCC over their period of their existence. Using panel data collected from the Department of Transportation, I perform an empirical analysis. I use a fixed-effect regression model to incorporate time and market fixed-effects. My empirical results add to the limited research on ULCC and demonstrate a unique decrease in fare to be associated with ULCCs. With my updated econometric model, additional control variables are included which more adequately represent the effect of ULCCs on airfare. This research was presented at the 2018 National Conference for Undergraduate Research.



# The Impact of Ultra-Low-Cost-Carriers on Market Airfare

Roselyn Anderson, Dr. Zach Raff, University of Wisconsin-Stout

Background	Data Summary	Market Share																																																															
<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>Since the airline deregulation, carriers have been classified based on their unit costs and fare offerings and were previously classified as either:<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>legacy carriers and low-cost carriers (LCC)</li></ul></li><li>In 2010 the classification of ultra-low-cost-carriers (ULCC) emerged in the US and features airlines with:<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>lower unit costs, offer extremely low base fares, and rely heavily on ancillary fees, e.g., baggage fees, to obtain revenue</li></ul></li><li>This study empirically explores the impact of the presence of ULCC’s on the average fare in a market</li></ul>	<p><b>Table 2: Carrier Classifications Count in Observations</b></p> <table><tr><th>ULCC</th><th>LCC</th><th>Legacy</th></tr><tr><td>327</td><td>357</td><td>452</td></tr></table> <p><b>Table 3: Competition Count</b></p> <table><tr><th>Competition 1</th><th>Competition 2</th><th>Competition 3</th><th>Competition 4</th></tr><tr><td>403</td><td>294</td><td>92</td><td>11</td></tr><tr><td>50%</td><td>37%</td><td>12%</td><td>1%</td></tr></table>	ULCC	LCC	Legacy	327	357	452	Competition 1	Competition 2	Competition 3	Competition 4	403	294	92	11	50%	37%	12%	1%																																														
ULCC	LCC	Legacy																																																															
327	357	452																																																															
Competition 1	Competition 2	Competition 3	Competition 4																																																														
403	294	92	11																																																														
50%	37%	12%	1%																																																														
Data Collection	Econometric Framework & Results	Application																																																															
<p>Data was collected from the DOT’s Domestic Airline Consumer Airfare Report. The data included domestic markets under 750 miles and average market fare, carrier average fare and passenger count</p> <p><b>Table 1: Summary Statistics</b></p> <table><tr><th></th><th>Miles</th><th>Market Fare</th><th>Passengers</th></tr><tr><td>Mean</td><td>503.92</td><td>\$243.03</td><td>26,369</td></tr><tr><td>Standard Error</td><td>5.46</td><td>3.05</td><td>1,637</td></tr></table>		Miles	Market Fare	Passengers	Mean	503.92	\$243.03	26,369	Standard Error	5.46	3.05	1,637	<p><math display="block">Airfare_{it} = \beta_0 + \beta_1*(Frontier_{it}) + \beta_2*(Allegiant_{it}) + \beta_3*(Spirit_{it}) + \beta_4*(American_{it}) + \beta_5*(Alaska_{it}) + \beta_6*(United_{it}) + \beta_7*(LCC_{it}) + \beta_8*(Hub_i) + \beta_9*(Miles_i) + \beta_{10}*(Competition_{it}) + \alpha_t + R_i*\gamma_t + U_{it}</math></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>The dependent variable is the average market fare, which is a weighted average of: carrier’s fare * passenger share</li><li>A fixed-effect regression model is used to estimate the binary measure of the presence of ULCC’s. The ULCC category was assigned “1” if Frontier, Allegiant and/or Spirit are present, “0” if they are not</li></ul> <p><b>Table 4: Fixed Effects Estimation Results</b></p> <table><tr><th>Variables</th><th>Coefficients</th><th>P-Value</th></tr><tr><td>(Constant)</td><td>289.63***</td><td>0.000</td></tr><tr><td>Frontier</td><td>-187.6***</td><td>0.000</td></tr><tr><td>Allegiant</td><td>-183.52***</td><td>0.000</td></tr><tr><td>Spirit</td><td>-147.25***</td><td>0.000</td></tr><tr><td>American</td><td>-9.46**</td><td>0.04</td></tr><tr><td>Alaska</td><td>-108.44***</td><td>0.000</td></tr><tr><td>United</td><td>-21.8***</td><td>0.000</td></tr><tr><td>LCC</td><td>-88.13***</td><td>0.000</td></tr><tr><td>HUB</td><td>-4.88</td><td>0.31</td></tr><tr><td>Miles</td><td>0.002</td><td>0.871</td></tr><tr><td>Competition 2</td><td>30.71***</td><td>0.000</td></tr><tr><td>Competition 3</td><td>48.78***</td><td>0.000</td></tr><tr><td>Competition 4</td><td>34.62**</td><td>0.039</td></tr><tr><td>Year-Quarter FE</td><td>Yes</td><td></td></tr><tr><td>Region-quarter FE</td><td>Yes</td><td></td></tr><tr><td colspan="3">Adjusted R Square: 0.803</td></tr></table> <p>* = 90% significance, ** = 95% significance, *** = 99% significance</p>	Variables	Coefficients	P-Value	(Constant)	289.63***	0.000	Frontier	-187.6***	0.000	Allegiant	-183.52***	0.000	Spirit	-147.25***	0.000	American	-9.46**	0.04	Alaska	-108.44***	0.000	United	-21.8***	0.000	LCC	-88.13***	0.000	HUB	-4.88	0.31	Miles	0.002	0.871	Competition 2	30.71***	0.000	Competition 3	48.78***	0.000	Competition 4	34.62**	0.039	Year-Quarter FE	Yes		Region-quarter FE	Yes		Adjusted R Square: 0.803			<p><b>Estimated Market Fare</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>We can forecast the market fare when a specific classification is present</li><li>The model estimates the following for ULCC’s: Spirit is associated with a \$142.38 fare, Allegiant with a \$106.11 fare, Frontier with a \$102.03 fare</li><li>A LCC is associated with a \$201.5 average fare and Delta (Legacy) associated with a \$289.63 average fare</li><li>On average ULCC’s are \$84.66 cheaper than LCC’s and \$172 cheaper than legacies</li></ul>
	Miles	Market Fare	Passengers																																																														
Mean	503.92	\$243.03	26,369																																																														
Standard Error	5.46	3.05	1,637																																																														
Variables	Coefficients	P-Value																																																															
(Constant)	289.63***	0.000																																																															
Frontier	-187.6***	0.000																																																															
Allegiant	-183.52***	0.000																																																															
Spirit	-147.25***	0.000																																																															
American	-9.46**	0.04																																																															
Alaska	-108.44***	0.000																																																															
United	-21.8***	0.000																																																															
LCC	-88.13***	0.000																																																															
HUB	-4.88	0.31																																																															
Miles	0.002	0.871																																																															
Competition 2	30.71***	0.000																																																															
Competition 3	48.78***	0.000																																																															
Competition 4	34.62**	0.039																																																															
Year-Quarter FE	Yes																																																																
Region-quarter FE	Yes																																																																
Adjusted R Square: 0.803																																																																	
Carrier Classifications	Future Research																																																																
<p><b>Ultra-low-cost-carriers</b></p> <p><b>Low-cost-carriers</b></p> <p><b>Legacy</b></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>Further analysis could be performed on each of the ULCC’s over time. Previous literature suggests the effect to be partially diminishing as carriers try to yield higher revenue opportunities (Swelbar &amp; Wittman, 2013)</li><li>Competition interaction variables could also be included. This would be able to identify the estimated fare impacts of two, three, or even four carriers competing in a single market</li></ul>																																																																
References																																																																	
<ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>Swelbar, W. S., &amp; Wittman, M. D. (2013). Evolving Trends of U.S. Domestic Airfares: The Impacts of Competition, Consolidation, and Low-Cost Carriers. MIT International Center for Air Transportation.</li></ul>																																																																	

